Anina Schmid & Leo Graf

METHOD OF

SPACIALCRITIQUE

1. Edition

Arch Education Limited Wolfgang-Pauli-Campus Zürich Y, Switzerland

Departement for Urban Cities, Institut Theoretical Praxis, Perception and Reproduction, University

ISBN: 000-0-0000-0000-0 (Softcover) ISBN: 000-0-0000-0000-0 (Hardcover)

Original copyright © Leo Graf & Anina Schmid 2020 Text copyright © Arch Education Ltd 2020 All rights reserved

The moral rights of the authors have been asserted

Typeset by Graphiccraft Ltd, Wien Set in 14/16 pt Suisse BP Int'l Exported to PDF Translated by Deepl.com

All rights reserved; no part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without the

prior written premission of the Publishers.

Published by Arch Education Ltd

1. Edition

METHOD OF SPACIAL CRITIQUE

Anina Schmid & Leo Graf

Departement for Urban Cities, Institut Theoretical Praxis, Perception and Reproduction, University

ETHY

Eidgenössische Technische Hochschule Y Swiss Federal Institute of Critique Y

At the beginning our method is introduced with a theory. With practical examples we want to explain the method. These spatial interventions will be described in their relation to the method. In this sense, the practice and the reflection behind it is to be understood as an exemplary and not definitive implementation of the theory. The practical examples intervene in the Toni-Areal, the seat of the Zurich University of the Arts and the Zurich University of Applied Sciences, and were created in our design studio with Prof. Adam Caruso. A conclusion should reflect on the success of the method and its spectrum of applicability in architectural design. In the appendix you will find a script for an example of a performative form of presentation of the spatial interventions, presented on 26 May 2020.

THEORY

8

Continous text how to translate a artifical critique into a spacial critique

DOCUMENTATION₁₈

plenty of well observed places around the toni-areal all documented in pictures

ANALYSIS

30

twleve detailed analysis plans which formulate and locate the critique

CHOREOGRAPHY 54

seven plans out of pictures and text speaking about the interventions

STAGE

70

four handmade visualization of ideal proposals

6

REFLECTION

80

a diagrann of the crucial part of what we do

VICTORY

nothing more to say

APPENDIX

90

_ skript _ vis-kom

Leo Graf Anina Schmid Andrea Fraser Pierre Bourdieu

This theory is a logical mind construct, which is the beginning and the foundation of our method. Various sources and important

personalities form this theory and shape the whole method. Andrea Fraser is clearly our greatest role model and showed the way forward.

First, the problem of architecture is pointed out and the architect's dilemma is described. A large part is dedicated to Andrea Fraser, how she works and how she criticizes. The first proposal of a translation of this art method into a design method is disclosed on the following pages. The describtion is fundamentally about how one criticizes and how one should perform during a whole design process. Finally, we go back to our origin, the Toni Areal, where our method will be applied.

To make it even clearer, we have of course visualized the theory. It is the form of a mind map, which is ideal for this purpose. This representation does not demand a completed process, does not demand conclusiveness and brings together different actors and contents.

THEORY THEOR THEO THE TH

In many design disciplines, as well as in architectural design, there is the paradox of the demand for an analytical and differentiated examination of a problem, as well as the demand for a clear solution. Architectural projects have the demand for a differentiated understanding of a topic in order to reach a certain qualitative level for finding a solution. This process is not objective, but is controlled by subjective-selective perception, which ultimately becomes a problem when communicating the approach to a solution. Since we do not know any loss-free form of communication, our most common forms of communication are based on an abstraction of the facts in order to make them transportable. An important factor for forms of communication is also culture. In architecture, for example, economic aspects strongly determine the abstraction and form of communication of the contents. But many other influences also play an important role, such as institutions. The understanding of a complex issue must therefore always be communicated in a certain way in order to be understood.

An example of an artist who deals with forms of communication is Andrea Fraser. Her work can be described as performance art. In terms of content, she exaggerates institutional problems that she regards as questionable, and thus criticizes institutional systems. By imitating stereotypical behaviour patterns and idioms of institutional formalities, she presents herself as part of the institutional system. The unusual exaggeration of her imitation creates intentional contradictions with her spoken content. Through this irony she exposes her critical attitude. Her performance is always the expression of a superordinate critique, while the specific content is always about different critical perspectives of this superordinate critique. These themes come together in an unusually grotesque way. It is precisely this grotesque form that has a communicative strength. Because the content does not follow more comprehensible structures or a linear narrative, their performance is able to resemble the complexity of an institutional system through a conglomerate of impressions and content.

Fraser's work can be regarded as a purely critical work, but if one is aware of the value of its form of expression, it can certainly be understood as productive.

Fraser's work reflects not only institutions and their social field, but also her own relationship to them. She always reflects on the issues she criticizes in relation to herself, which gives her work a self-critical aspect. It is precisely this self-critical attitude that enables her to develop her own kind of performance, which speaks much more about having an idea of things as they really are than about wanting to be understood.

We translate these qualities we describe into a design method.

The method aims to bring a critical understanding into a productive form and can be described analogously to Andrea Fraser's work.

The communication medium of a planner has its own complexity. On the one hand, it consists of different forms of representation such as plans, visualizations and language that promise a project in the future, but on the other hand it also consists of the actual object that is built. The architect's art consists in being aware of the possible differences between the promised and the real effect of a project. As a planner, you do not always have to want to achieve what you promise. Good planning, however, requires that one is aware of these differences and makes conscious use of them. In order to be aware of these differences, a planner must always be able to critically

11

10



question his project. In practice, this self-criticism usually comes to an end at some point in the design process. For a project to have a better chance of being executed, it must sell itself in our culture through a certain clarity and self-assurance. Contradictions are avoided and an initially differentiated attitude ends in the best possible compromise that has to be sold.

Yet contradictions, like the irony in Andrea Fraser's work, could also be a chance for planning. A project that thrives on contradictions can develop its own qualities. A continuously critical work process has the chance to go all the way to the finished project, not having to speak of a claim to finality. It is able to find a way of dealing with the contradictions of reality. This design attitude is thus not only able to define space, but also to raise questions through contradictions in order to sensitize for certain topics. This not only with regard to the built object, but also to the presentation and communication of the intention.

For the application of our method we have looked at the Toni-Areal in Zurich. The building is the headquarters of the Zurich University of the Arts and serves as a building for the Department of Social Work and the Department of Applied Psychology of the Zurich University of Applied Sciences. These thoughts lead us to the start of our analysis. Andrea Fraser would claim the need for a bigger picture.

13



We take a critical look at the social fabric that animates the building, at the built structure, its organisation and appropriation, but also at the history of the building's origins. The goal of our intervention is to sensitize the users about the possibilities of their strongly institutionally controlled space. Like Andrea Fraser, our critical project lives from various points of criticism, which in the first place do not have the compulsion to have a clear, overarching narrative, although they share our basic critical attitude. The focus is on formu-14 lating an antithesis to the existing, over-organized space. This contradictoriness is not intended to create a distance to the existing, but rather an immediate relationship. This relationship can become the obvious expression of the interventions and point to issues that we consider important. Moments in the building that we consider to be deficiencies are not simply replaced with other solutions. The interventions should create an awareness of the contradictions in the building. Interventions that pose spatial contradictions as questions to the users are considered productive. Possible qualities can be created, but must create obvious contrasts to the existing building. The critical understanding of the intervention should always be maintained. To achieve this, and at the same time to have an idea of the difference between our idea and the view of the users, we regularly consult with the users of the Toni site. In order to obtain valuable feedback, the presentation also focuses on the contradictory nature of the intervention. Anyone who receives an explanation and presentation of the project should, if possible, ask themselves the questions we wanted to address as a reaction. We thus regularly check the congruence between intention and possible effect. Attention should be drawn to the contradictions but interpretation should not be predetermined. The space, unlike institutional space, should not prescribe a use but rather suggest an appropriation.

The project will be carried out at the time of the Corona crisis, when the users have to stay away from the building. The users experience the effect of the institution detached from its spatiality. We want to use this moment to find out what is or is not missing from the building itself.

It is also impossible to avoid the fact that we ourselves already have ideas about what should be criticized in the building. These ideas will be relativized in a self-critical discussion by exposing one's own opinion to one's own and to the criticism of others as much as possible. This relativization thus also includes an examination of the positive aspects of an object. Project ideas arise from the consideration of the critical and positive aspects. An intervention can thematize something by exaggerating or competing with something, and emerge as a reaction to the discovered themes. The ideas should cover as many aspects as possible and as a series as many aspects as possible. Interventions designed according to this method must not only refer to negative aspects.

At the point where we now find ourselves, it becomes obvious that we are at an interface of theory, practice and analysis.



16

17

Right from the start it is important to document an object in a differentiated way. What matters is to go on site to get an individual picture of the object. The exact observation and documentation is an important part of the analysis, but it requires that one is not influenced by conventional patterns of thought. Many conventions ignore a wide range of facts and suggest wrong approaches and solutions. The crucial thing is to repeatedly record personal experiences and reflect on them critically. You don't want to think about the wrong solutions.

DOCUME DOCUME DOCU DOCUME DOCUME NTATION

Leo Graf **Anina Schmid** EM2N Google

NTATION





fig. 002	fig. 002
fig. 002	fig. 002
fig. 002	fig. 002

fig. 002	fig. 002
fig. 002	fig. 002
fig. 002	fig. 002

2	20





fig. 002	fig. 002	
fig. 002	fig. 002	
fig. 002	fig. 002	

fig. 002	fig. 002
fig. 002	fig. 002
fig. 002	fig. 002





fig. 002	fig. 002
fig. 002	fig. 002
fig. 002	fig. 002

fig. 002	fig. 002
fig. 002	fig. 002
fig. 002	fig. 002





fig. 002	fig. 002
fig. 002	fig. 002
fig. 002	fig. 002

fig. 002	fig. 002
fig. 002	fig. 002
fig. 002	fig. 002





fig. 002	fig. 002
fig. 002	fig. 002
fig. 002	fig. 002

fig. 002	fig. 002
fig. 002	fig. 002
fig. 002	fig. 002

In order to develop a productive critique, a valuable analysis is crucial. In a spatial critique, one has a strong relation to the object, but it must be considered in a larger context.

It is not a matter of dealing only with technical and spatial aspects of the existing building. Architecture is about more. It is about the existing construction, but even more about the related mindset. The thoughts and opinions of the whole social field are important components that need to be examined. They are in a complex context and explain how different components relate to each other.

The bigger picture generates multi-layered and differentiated content. These contents must be analysed and assessed by us as experts. This involves separating emotions from statements, setting priorities and putting different aspects into context. It is up to us to formulate and localise the resulting criticism.

Leo Graf Anina Schmid Bigger picture

AAAA NNNNAAAA YYY SISIS S









FOR YOUR ATTENTION

critique - process - competition - selling project / critique - institutions - politics rules / critique - institutions - politics control /critique - institutions - politics adaptation of walls / critique - institutions politics - image - selling through apperance / critique - institutions - politics - image - uniformality / critique - building space - specific function / "If the building were more appropriate, it might be more raw and chaotic and therefore less Swiss. One might ask, "What are our boys doing there? But actually, it could use a bit more anarchy." / critique - building - appearance - monotony / critique - building appearance - acceptable / critique building - technical organization - control // gualities - process - competition - different solutions / qualities - institutions - politics / qualities - building - space - diversity / qualities - user

			0.15
KEY	ALLREAL TONI AG, ZÜ8RICH Eqbühlstrasse 18, 8050 Zürich,	Date	17.05.2020
CONCRETE	Tel. +41 00 000 00 00, info@askallreal.ch	Job - Nr.	2'201
BRICK	AS-BUILT PLAN, TONI-AREAL	Format	adapted to layout
SANDSTONE	Entrance Hall, Floorplan, 3. floor,	Plan - Nr.	00.01
IIMESTONE	DEPARTMENT FOR URBAN CITIES	Scale	adapted to the plan
STEEL	Leo Graf & Anina Schmid	revision idx.	2.3 AS
PLASTER	Institut Theoretical Praxis, Preception and Reproduction, State University Wolfgang-Pauli-Campus, 8000 Zürich,	CAD infor.	vwx
OK Fertig Floor 3. Floor: +/- 4.25 = 303.24 m.ü.M.	Tel. +41 00 000 00 00, info@askexperts.ch	Signature	



ROOM STAMPS Exhibition Action Room Studio FB ▽ 409.39 B concrete 15 24 4 1 RB 🗸 409.3 W brick RB 🗸 409.3 W brick RB 🗸 409.3 W brick BF #3# BF #3# BF #3# BF #3# LRH 7.5 D concrete 0.1 LRH 7.5 D concrete 0.1 LRH 3.5 D concrete LRH 3.5 D concrete 0.1 Telephone Cabin Corridor Corner Courtyard 54 2 5 17 RB 🗸 409.3 W brick RB ▽ 409.3 W brick RB 🗸 409.3 W brick RB 🗢 409.3 W brick BF #3# BF #3# LRH BF #3# LRH 3.5 D concrete BF #3# LRH 3.5 D concrete 0.1 LRH 3.5 D concrete 0.1 D concret Public Space Stage Transistion Toilet FB ♥ 409.39 B concrete 76 3 6 19 RB ▽ 409.3 W brick BF #3# BF #3# LRH 3.3 D concrete 0.1 BF #3# LRH 7.5 D concrete 0.1 BF #3# LRH 7.5 D concrete 0.1 LRH 7.5 D concrete 0.1

FOR YOUR ATTENTION

critique - institutions - politics - rules / "We remove things that are really scribbles. vou can usually already identify them. People always say everything is art, but it's not all art. If it becomes political with unacceptable content, we take it away. In the meantime it works quite well, but maybe something boils up every two years. Then we have to remove stuff again." critique - institutions - politics students deliver / critique - institutions politics - decision making / critique institutions - politics - control /critique institutions - politics - adaptation of walls / critique - institutions - politics - image selling through apperance / critique institutions - politics - image - elite /critique - institutions - politics - organized events /

critique - building - space - defined space / critique - building - space - controlled public space / critique - building - space respect of the building / critique - building apperancce -acceptable // "If the building were more appropriate, it might be more raw and chaotic and therefore less Swiss." / gualities - process - competition - different solutions / qualities - process - focus talking about synergy and exchange / qualities - institutions - politics performance oriented / gualities - building - space - diagonal Cascade / qualities building - space - individual locations / gualities - building - space - diversity / qualities - user - students - spontaneous parties //

			0.1
KEY	ALLREAL TONI AG, ZÜ8RICH Eqbühlstrasse 18, 8050 Zürich,	Date	17.05.2020
CONCRETE	Tel. +41 00 000 00 00, info@askallreal.ch	Job - Nr.	2'201
BRICK	AS-BUILT PLAN, TONI-AREAL	Format	adapted to layout
SANDSTONE	Cascade Room, Floorplan, 5. floor,	Plan - Nr.	00.01
ISOLATION	DEPARTMENT FOR URBAN CITIES	Scale	adapted to the plan
STEEL	Leo Graf & Anina Schmid Institut Theoretical Praxis, Preception and Reproduction, State University Wolfgang-Pauli-Campus, 8000 Zürich, Tel. +41 00 000 00 00, info@askexperts.ch	revision idx.	2.3 AS
PLASTER 		CAD infor.	vwx
OK Fertig Floor 3. Floor: +/- 4.25 = 303.24 m.ü.M.		Signature	





FOR YOUR ATTENTION

critique - process focus - full the main actors needs / critique institutions - politics rules / "The fact that the university controls us provokes me, but that doesn't make me creative. Quite the opposite, in fact, It's not cool."/

critique - institutions politics - / control /critique - institutions politics - adaptation of walls / critique institutions - politics image - selling through apperance / critique institutions - politics image - uniformality / critique - institutions politics - organized

events / critique building - space controlled public space / critique - building space - respect of the building / critique building - apperancce -acceptable // "It was something new at the beginning and a building without patina is difficult for an art

school." / qualities - user students - resistance in corridory / gualities user - principal awareness: lack of anarchy // "You can go on the walls, but it depends on what you write. There were a few posters where they said they

would close our mouths, or something like that, and then they took them away. It's controlled."

ALLREAL TONI AG, ZÜ8RICH 17.05.2020 Date Egbühlstrasse 18, 8050 Zürich, Tel. +41 00 000 00 00, info@askallreal.ch Job - Nr. 2'201 AS-BUILT PLAN, TONI-AREAL Format adapted to layout The Corridor, Floorplan, 5. floor, Plan - Nr. 00.01 Scale adapted to the plan DEPARTMENT FOR URBAN CITIES Leo Graf & Anina Schmid revision idx. 2.3 AS Institut Theoretical Praxis, Preception and Reproduction, State University CAD infor. vwx Wolfgang-Pauli-Campus, 8000 Zürich, Tel. +41 00 000 00 00, info@askexperts.ch Signature







FOR YOUR ATTENTION

critique - process - focus - economics / critique - institutions - politics - rules / critique - institutions - politics - students deliver / critique - institutions - politics control /critique - institutions - politics adaptation of walls / "We would like to see dance or music here, but on the other side it doesn't have to be a venue. Here we have to work. You don't do this to satisfy tourists." / critique - institutions - politics image - uniformality / critique - institutions - politics - abundance of tools / critique institutions - politics - incomprehensible / critique - building - space - defined space / critique - building - space - specific function / critique - building - apperancce sealed //

"Honestly, you wouldn't even notice that there's music and stuff like that."/ qualities - process - focus - talking about synergy and exchange / gualities process - focus - understandable concept / qualities - institutions - politics performance oriented / qualities - building - space - visual transparency / qualities building - space - visual transparency / gualities - building- infrastructure - offer / gualities - building- infrastructure - high quality //

			0.1
KEY	ALLREAL TONI AG, ZÜ8RICH Eqbühlstrasse 18, 8050 Zürich,	Date	17.05.2020
CONCRETE	Tel. +41 00 000 00 00, info@askallreal.ch	Job - Nr.	2'201
BRICK	AS-BUILT PLAN, TONI-AREAL	Format	adapted to layout
SANDSTONE	Rooms, Floorplan, 1./ 2. / 3. / 4./ 5./ 6./ 7. floor,	Plan - Nr.	00.01
INDESTONE	DEPARTMENT FOR URBAN CITIES	Scale	adapted to the plan
STEEL	Leo Graf & Anina Schmid Institut Theoretical Praxis, Preception and Reproduction, State University Wolfgang-Pauli-Campus, 8000 Zürich, Tel. +41 00 000 00 00, info@askexperts.ch	revision idx.	2.3 AS
PLASTER		CAD infor.	vwx
OK Fertig Floor 3. Floor: +/- 4.25 = 303.24 m.ü.M.		Signature	









apperance / critique - institutions - politics

- abundance of tools / critique - building -

space - specific function / critique -

			0.15
KEY	ALLREAL TONI AG, ZÜ8RICH Eqbühlstrasse 18, 8050 Zürich,	Date	17.05.2020
CONCRETE	Tel. +41 00 000 00 00, info@askallreal.ch	Job - Nr.	2'201
BRICK	AS-BUILT PLAN, TONI-AREAL	Format	adapted to layout
SANDSTONE	Rooms, Floorplan, 1./ 2. / 3. / 4./ 5./ 6./ 7. floor,	Plan - Nr.	00.01
ISOLATION	DEPARTMENT FOR URBAN CITIES	Scale	adapted to the plan
STEEL	Leo Graf & Anina Schmid Institut Theoretical Praxis, Preception and Reproduction, State University Wolfgang-Pauli-Campus, 8000 Zürich, Tel. +41 00 000 00 00, info@askexperts.ch	revision idx.	2.3 AS
PLASTER		CAD infor.	vwx
OK Fertig Floor 3. Floor: +/- 4.25 = 303.24 m.ü.M.		Signature	



ROOM STAMPS

0.15





focus - fast development / critique process - focus - full the main actors needs / critique - institutions interdisciplinary - ZHdK & ZHAW / critique institutions interdisciplinary - within departments / critique institutions - politics -

rules / "How should I cri get inspired, like what? teo Like to practice more or co what?" bu critique - institutions - org politics - control / co critique - building - bu space - defined space / org critique - building - au space - specific space / cri critique - building - teo apperancce - monotony ba

critique - building technical organization control / critique building - technical organization coomplexity / critique building - technical organization auto-regulation / critique - building technical organization badge // "I would wish for more mixing of the students from different studies and departments" qualities - process focus - talking about synergy and exchange / qualities - institutions politics / qualities building - space individual locations / qualities - building - space - diversity / qualities - building infrastructure - offer / qualities - building infrastructure - high quality // "You don't get to know people from other depatments - only with the "Z-Moduls, which are very rare"

ALLREAL TONI AG, ZÜ8RICH Egbühlstrasse 18, 8050 Zürich,	Date	17.05.2020
Tel. +41 00 000 00 00, info@askallreal.ch	Job - Nr.	2'201
AS-BUILT PLAN, TONI-AREAL	Format	adapted to layout
Workspaces, Floorplan, 3. floor,	Plan - Nr.	00.01
DEPARTMENT FOR URBAN CITIES	Scale	adapted to the plan
Leo Graf & Anina Schmid Institut Theoretical Praxis, Preception and Reproduction,	revision idx.	2.3 AS
State University Wolfgang-Pauli-Campus, 8000 Zürich,	CAD infor.	vwx
Tel. +41 00 000 00 00, info@askexperts.ch	Signature	





politics - image -

chairs in the

individual locations /

48

Signature

Wolfgang-Pauli-Campus, 8000 Zürich,

Tel. +41 00 000 00 00, info@askexperts.ch





institutions - politics control / critique institutions - politics image - contemporary / critique - institutions politics - image -

apperancce - monotony "Nobody uses these chairs in the courtyard/terrace - you never see anyone sitting here. I don't

concept / qualities process - focus financial sustainability / qualities - building space - individuel locations / qualities -

creative. Quite the opposite, in fact. It's not cool." qualities - building space - visual transparency / qualities - user - students -

AS-BUILT PLAN, TONI-AREAL	Format	adapted to layout
Courtyards, Floorplan, 5. floor,	Plan - Nr.	00.01
DEPARTMENT FOR URBAN CITIES	Scale	adapted to the plar
Leo Graf & Anina Schmid Institut Theoretical Praxis, Preception and Reproduction,	revision idx.	2.3 AS
State University Wolfgang-Pauli-Campus, 8000 Zürich,	CAD infor.	vwx
Tel. +41 00 000 00 00, info@askexperts.ch	Signature	





focus - fast

critique - institutions -

events //

qualities - user

CAD infor.

Signature

Wolfgang-Pauli-Campus, 8000 Zürich,

Tel. +41 00 000 00 00, info@askexperts.ch

vwx

Analysed and localised points of criticism have to be converted into a spacial design. But this criticism does not protect us from repeating the same mistakes. Projects with a claim to conclusiveness and a one-sided economic intention must be avoided. Rather, the aim of spatial criticism is to sensitise users to problems and to encourage them to co-create their surrounding. These interventions expresse a grotesque kind of criticism

CHOREO CHOREO CHOREO CHOREO CHOREO

but also open up potential. According to the principle of ongoing criticism, it is essential that the proposals are continually reviewed and expanded through exchange and critical reflection. Leo Graf Anina Schmid

GRAPHY

GRAPHY

GRAPHY



OPEN ATELIER

F7_ "are you more quiet because you feel observed or will it be too loud?"

P12 Humans are physically weak, which we compensate for with culture. We build islands of reliability with our culture. Humans are always trying to reduce the complexity of their lives. Systems that we develop have the basic function of relieving us. Together, these reliefs then have a productive effect because they manifest themselves, for example, in something like "division of labour".

P3_ "ah I thought it's the corridor"

B17 The Problem is, to many doors, to many walls.

D1 By imitating stereotypical behaviour patterns and idioms of institutional formalities, she presents herself as part of the institutional system.

E6_ "There are doors with badge, doors with lock, and rooms that have a door with badge and a door with lock. There are doors with handles and doors with knobs, doors that can be opened in one direction with a handle and in the other direction only with a badge, [doors that cannot be unlocked and doors that cannot be closed.] There are areas of the house that are open when you come from the left and only with badge when you come from the right. There are doors that are allowed to be open, doors that are not allowed to be open, doors that are not allowed to be open, but are always open "





F1_ "there would be a mixture"

J11_ "it reminds me of an atelier-space I loved to work in"

L5_ "the length has something spectacular"

N9 "some of the studio spaces are already connected with big doors"

F7_ "there are very different characters - how would it deal with that?"

D4 An open Atelier space lies behind a wall with doors. All students have only access to some of those doors.

C5_ "I know nobody from the other departments. Well i know somebody, a desginer."

K13 Continuous irritation of a certain type, cause the system to steer its structure in a certain direction. The system will adapt to these things and develop a competence of its own.

R4_ One will have to walk along the endless corridor with endless doors in order to get to the door that fits the badge. If you ring on a door you can hope that someone inside reacts to the red light and opens the door for you.

E10 "What dominates is a typically Zurich-style, well-designed modesty."



A field is a Field of forces within which the Agents occupy positions that statistically determine the **POSITIONS they will** take with respect to the fields, these **POSITION-TAKINGS** being aimed either at CONSERVING or TRANSFORMING the STRUCTURE **OF RELATIONS OF** FORCES that is constitutive of the field. Doxa describes the rules of the game and assumptions that exist in the conception of a social field. Everybody's position is aimed at either conserving or transforming the rules. Within this discourse people make use of their power or capital to impose the rules that favor them the most. We must encourage the conditions of

openness, mutability and inclusion to make the sustainable and democratic city of today.









This tells us that reality is a social concept: to exist, is to exist socially in relation to others. What is real, is relational. Power relations between and within fields structure human behavior. These speaker's desks could stand in a circle on the **Toni-Areal's roof** terrace. They represent a non-hirarchical construct like the "Stadtforum", a highly regarded example of a new approach to urban development and urban design. "I wouldn't be used as a discussion place - more to hang out" "that has something absurd which is good" "If they would be flat one could have an apero there" "An objective organism is formed from many subjective opinions".

We must encourage the conditions of by looking at this patio; the critique is clear: it's a huge space, maybe to big for openness, mutability and inclusion to make the sustainable and democratic a telephone box. You can only teach a child language as city of today. a stimulus and read it to him again and "It fits the architectonical style" again and talk to him. The child thus Mirror panels should exaggerate the introverted courtyard. They replace the creates its own logic from the stimuli. The child creates its own logic according existing facade elements.and their to the stimuli of its environment. This is angle block the view from the windows the basis for problems in socialization. to the courtyard. Voyeurism gets changed. I don't know how much peo-Different people have grown up in differ ple care about whether they can be ent families and cultures, which can lead seen or not. But of corse it's a different to irritations and conflicts between the feeling if one con't be observed even if systems, but which can adapt in a cer tain time. If one could change the mirone doesn't think about it. But what rors the light would be interesting and interests me much more is the mirror-effect itself. A room that conthe room would be somehow linving. stantly changes it's appearance. Interesting.



Maybe the input doesn't have to be architectural in order to create something architectural. Maybe architecture should be understood also as a political discipline. This idea completes the set of interventions. It strongly depends on the narrative. The output is controlled but open in a good way.

It would be an illusion to think everyone's eyes count the same. You can also design an event.

I think the proposals, which are the most architectural – which is a relief to me – were the best. This house is a field of opportunity.

If the school is harming the productivity and the adaptation of the space, maybe we shouldn't react on this with conven-

tional architecture. Architecture is the art of putting things together. The basic problem with these ideas is, who will do something with it? "I love wood." A jury from the school

would select the winner project and realize it.





And yes, they will do exactly what we immagine them to do! It's our profession to know.

A design competition should be held at the ZHDK. A modular furniture concept becomes the gift from the school

to all students. We enter institutions, we invest in them we internalize their values, their discourses, their ways of being, their modes of perception and classification.

And then we embody them, ... then we perform them in our lives and in our roles within institutions and our relationships with institutions. The institution itselfe should somehow suggest adaptation by not trying to conserve it's own image in a such controlled way.

"I would certainly use them to set up my atelier. They would also be nice to build something for exhibitions "

Competivity is a great way to generate intrinsic motivation and to make students deliver. We want to see big steps.



"Is a certain respect not necessary? Doesn't it has to be something serious once someone hainte and writes on to the walls?" The Walls within the **T**oni-Areal are freed from the plaster layer in a controlled_ manner "The problem is not the respect for be building but the time one needs to adapt walls **f**r space." "The process of appropriation can't really be controlled. We did a lot in the beginning I no make provide the second secon we **-en**abled the display of the walls. Not by everyone but by most. We have public zones that are very spacious and sideally are not escape Youtes. The escape routes go down on the <u>-outside</u>, which means that everything is playable and can be played on. It's all about things. **The most important thing is** Iose respect for the _ hat people and do what they want to do in here."

Have drawings that you make which are kind of analysis ▲ drawing that might be quite like a choreography almost about how you deal with it, and then you could make this models that can have a bit of variety to them, which is the result and then with the result you're not sure I if this is good or bad.-"I like that one can see the material.
the lt's some kind of reation, it's about destruction." "The problem is not the respect for the building but the time one needs to adapt walls or space." For a design process it is dangerous to take over questions and thus framework conditions without having understood them_Eor in order to new framework conditions, must be able to anticipate the existing ones

Leo Graf Anina Schmid

Images have power. This consciousness must be present in the whole process. Especially when presenting the best proposals, it is important to question this conventional communication. A picture shapes not only the imagination of the viewer, but also one's own. Certain visualizations of an idea lead to a reduced perception. This must be prevented. Spatial design must be viewed and presented from several perspectives.

S STA STAG STAGE














REFELEC NOIT REFELEC

Reflection is the essence of ongoing criticism and the core of the method. These next pages are not about reflecting on the individual steps of the work again and again, but about looking at the interventions in the overall picture. Some ideas are put on hold early on, others are still being worked on and others prove to be very productive. It is not crucial that each idea TION CELEFER TION

CELEER

can be tested and reflected in a visualization. The worth of this method the process and the combination of the individual interventions.

Leo Graf Anina Schmid

NOIT



the full transparency room



the arcade fragment



the modular gift

no changes





The critical aspect isn't as clear as it could be aswell as the mise en scene aspect is very contradictory to the functionality of the rooms. Therefore the idea migth only be worth with curtains. This could be implemented in the narrative and the ironi of beeing exposed or having no daylight. This decisionmaking could be the basis for a narrative but weakens the radicality of the idea.

> This proposal is a very architectural proposal, which is perhaps what makes it so exciting and good. The element speaks of an absence and also expresses a clear criticism. This intervention is very productive because it allows for very open functions, while not negating any other functions or spaces. The incompleteness of the object underlines a cynical but also poetic aspect.

This intervention establishes a clear reference to the construction process. At the same time it expresses criticism but also reminds us of a productive method and thus becomes a symbol. What was not apparent at first is that these objects can be very multifunctional. So this intervention can be seen as symbolic, but it can also be used. It functions as an aesthetic object but at the same time it contains criticism and cynicism.

> Maybe the input doesn't have to be architectural in order to create something architectural. Maybe architecture should be understood also as a political discipline. This idea completes the set of interventions. It strongly depends on the narrative. The output is controlled but open in a good way.

There are some places in the Toni area which are very productive and beautiful. One of these places is the roof terrace with its many places to stay. The location and the fresh air is certainly a big plus. In addition, it also has a diverse roof landscape, which breaks the monotony of the building. The quality of the place is expressed by the many visitors and spontaneous parties.

> This proposal has its strength in the transformation of the voyeuristic into self-reflection, which is very exciting. In doing so, he expresses several points of criticism. The atmosphere in the courtyard becomes more spectacular although it remains true to the "Toni style". Although it is a rather definite and fixed intervention, it does not disturb the functional openness.

the selfreflective courtyard



the pool courtyard

the open atelier



the flexible structure

the patina gallery

the interrogation room



It is obviously not obvious whether it is a good or a bad intervention. It leaves a lot of room for functionality, although the criticism of the object says the opposite. The deepening of the object counteracts the voyeuristic and evokes beautiful ideas. However, it also destroys spaces and it does not seem certain whether it can give the courtyard a better atmosphere.

We still appreciate the productivity and the concept of the intervention. However, it is again dependent on adaptation by the students, which weakens the idea a bit. But on the other hand the room is much needed.

We still need to question if it's critical or cynical enough - or why does have to be? Is the method productive because it has a wide range of outputs or does the all have to have the same language. In the end it has more the language of a solution which is not our intention. There is a lot of potential which we should further think through and improve. This room is our longest companion and is highly appreciated. Through a clear cynicism he expresses a versatile criticism. But the criticism also clearly opens up opportunities, which were desired by many users. It is a very architecturally safe intervention but at the same time it does not lose its "mise-en-scène" character. This opening up of the floor plan could also occur in several places and create qualities especially for the students' workplaces.

We like it. The stregths are, that it's working on a smaller scale than the other ideas, it works whether it is adapted or not, the same idea can have different outcomes with different moods and different sizes, it can either be developed further or give way to something else and has no final claim.

The interpretation is provoked but not in an intrusive way. The possibilities for interpretation are complex but not too obvious.

The cynical aspect is stronger than the productivity aspect.

There are a lot of people who are not that political as the interviews have shown. There are options to be active but. maybe it's not a spacial problem - more in the organisational level.

The fact, that it requires an optimization of the program and the fact that there are allready some kind of rooms that one can discover make this idea worse. As a story its strong but to close to what's allready there. Nontheless they are discovered differently than the rooms from the room-exchange-platform.

the ghost room

VICTORY

Leo Graf Anina Schmid

For Andrea Fraser it's not always clear what reactions she triggers with her performances. Observing the reactions of her audience is an important part of her constant self-critical examination. She works on several levels of communication. The fundamental difficulty of translating her method into architecture lies in the multimedia nature of architecture as a form of communication. In comparison to Andrea Fraser, architecture happens in a less protected setting than Fraser's performances and acts on more levels of communication. A planner must be able to master the different levels of communication and communicate his project. The question now is whether the various representations of the project on its various levels of communication should have a complex, grotesque expression or whether the representation itself should be uniform and transparent and its content complex. In the later case, one runs the risk of achieving a certain poetic banality that loses content. In the former, on the other hand, complexity can create an impression of arbitrariness and thus lose focus on the content.

The examples aren't able to show a big variety regarding the scale of the interventions. In this particular exmple the interventions are strongly about the perception of the space which demands for a certain scale. To ensure that the interventions are understood as a unit, they are kept on a similar scale. An intervention in the building's signalling could no longer be understood spatially, while a change to an entire floor plan, for example, threatens to be read at the level of perception no longer in contrast to the existing building. Perhaps as individual interventions or in a different context, such interventions are quite conceivable.

In concrete terms, the question arises as to how strongly the interventions should be read as a unit, both in themselves and together.

With regard to this question, the project could still be sharpened.

88

APPENDIX

_skript

92

Final Crits / ZOOM / Time and Date hasn't been realsed yet.

_vis-kom

96

The communication with the users is a crucial part of the method and ongoing critism. How to communicate with unprofessionals is documented on the next pages.

_skript

Final Crits / ZOOM / Time and Date hasn't been realsed yet.





SKRIPT	Excerpt of "Umbau Toni-Area	l Bauprojek - 🗧 Janine Schiller & Katharina N	<u>Vill – 2016, S.13</u> Stating that architects understand more that
SARIPI	Soffizielle Broschüre Hochbauar	nte Better than the cuddly surro	oundings [at the "ordinary people"
<u>"Reflecting on architecture</u>	is a crucial part of a <u>f</u> lagship of Swiss architectur	e and the Swiss rold location in Kreis 5, where it	almost become
what we do, especially auri	ng this time, whee https://www.zhdk.ob/filo/l		ronment is goode - mormation we gathered by Unristian Pos
	A Resolution of the second state of the second	0.1.1.c.5.8.a.c.b.= the people have to be much	more resistance, a noten about the is-ought-problem articula
		a screen 960 tive with the environment"	
and provisional uses			
	conditions of open-	¹⁶ Excerpt of "Das Toni-Fraktal	.", Kathrin Passic 🧠 Excerpt of "An Interview with Pierre Huydhe
🔫 ssy y 🔺 iiiy 💷 melusi	on to make the sus 🔨 Excerpt of an Interview wit	h Daniel Nigglissin «Zürcher Hochschule der K	(ünste: Toni-Are , by George Baker, 2004
- Jourd Jon. d. mo	y of toda 🖉 👘 👘 from EM2N, Zett Magazin; "Für	Zürich-West in al» - Janine Schiller & Katha	rina Nill – 2018
https://www.caruso.arch.e	hz.ch/programme/ Speziellen wirkt es wie ein Vita	mindrin 🗟 👘 🔍 S.47 /4 😜	Quotation of Benjamin Groothuijse duri
fs-2020/studie	https://zett.zhdk.ch/2016/03/1	.4/etwas-meh	- Panel 02, ETH Hönggerberg, FS2
(visited 09.03.2020)	anarchie-waere-nicht-schlecht	/ 📬 🦉 Inspired by a passage in "I	Damaged Goods 📲 not a problem that we mention Pier
		Gallery Talk Starts Here (Exce	erpt)", by Andrea Huyghe"
Excerpt of the description	of the department Citation of Christian Schm	d about Zurien Traser, 1986: "() I have to ren	nind you – it's me
of architecture at EIH b	y Prot. Philip Prot. West published in Hochparterre	e Magazine, orig e <i>cresponsibility to remind you</i> –	that no one, not 28 That's what we say
Sprung	at ist doss dia Luit orig DE: "Es dominica	even a abcent, may touch wol	
	r Snakulatism night Similatis innto Biodorko #"	- fitting to make a point about	architecture ded
	er Diszinlin zu Gute 📲 Das ist ein völlig introvertierte	s Gehäude, nach society. If it's true is not imnor	tale and the second of Padeast on Spatify, "Bad at Spor
	Disziplin zu kennep – dussen ist es fast hermetisch a		Foisode 370: Andrea Fraser", 1. October 201
heisst auch zu verhindern.	dass Architektur in a https://www.hochparterre.	ch/nachricht - Random talking - inspired b	y random talking 1.12.12
		t/detail/zue	an "artist's la-
any han that thisse at	e z 🖌 Disziplin, um 🗧 ch-west-zu-tode-entwickett/14	457950460 <u>4</u> - guage"	Inspired by/Adjusted Excerpt of Podcast of
			Spotify: "Bad at Sports Episode 370: Andr
die anderen beargwöhnen,	nennen wir die Ale 💶 Excerpt of "Freiräume erm	iöglichen", pub 🖶 🛰 Excerpt of Pressetext, El	M2N-Homepage – Fraser", 1. October 2012, 1:12:17; This is a hi
🚽 tonomie der Architek ur." 🛬	- L lished in NZZ, 12.09.2014: http	s://www.nzz.ch e 	EM2N", by Per-for every very observing listener/participant
https://arch.ethz.ch/dvparte	ement.htm	ume-ermoegi - Vittorio Aureli:	- Inis performance
visited U9.U3.2U20		Mathias Muller and Daniel N	ligguj They have
3 Event of "Eine Kunstford	sile für 775 Millionan Elle Evagent of all aithild 70 rah	ar Hookeehult af in FMONL that they begin to	neir architectule 11 ineory of Fields by Pierre Bourdieue
Frankon" 1/ 0/ 2017: «	lik lur // 5 Millionene Excerpt of «Leitoitu Zurch	er nochschule - Jimm Emizing under uney know no	areions."
Toni-Molkerei liefern sie ni	iit aem Umbau 🚓 🔍 der Kunste» 🚬	t und leistunge white pullous por complex conve	avisaboutembre provocatively question what an architect
		a mannerismend the work of em 2	and does and question ourselves and all
https://www.pzz.ch/zuerio	/eine-kunstfabreik-		
-fuer-775-millionen-franken	-1.18284127 Excerpt of "Das Toni-Areal P	ann zum Hoc 🐑 20 Fitting fact of history exagge	erated to back the
	schul-Campus umgestaltet we	rden 🗧 🚽 the point about amazing archit	ect (even thougher ³⁴ Another hint at the distinction between wh
- Excerpt of "Umbau Toni-A	real_Bauprojete»nttps://www.nzz.ch/das_tor	il-areal_kannthe Greek temptes were not	even necessarie we say, do and mean or suggest
- offizielle Broschüre Hochba	uamtelochschulcampus_umge	staltet_werdenty built by architects as we k	now them today
nttps://www.znak.cn/fil	e/live/5d/5d17	doesn't matter because may	ybe people done 🔩 Suggesting that what we told you is knov
410ec03fb1c65bfad0	df5011c58ach-	know that)	edge we were fed by our position in fields, a
d 21<u>c</u>1/20120513_bauproje	kt_ta_screen_96d ¹³ Citation of Adam Caruso a	: Panel 02, ET	through our position in the field were able
	Honggerberg, FS20	Wikipedia definition of architecture	tecture exagger , present to you, maybe you believed it all – r
The second of WENDON	to milly factory for the factory	alve the wrong archi	lecture is art of saying that the information is not "true
Excerpt of EMZN conver	ts milk factory for They were already asked to s	solve the wrong amore:Baukunst	relitation in the second these paters we thenk you! The
The building os aity the ait		- area-state with edia.org/with A	rchitektu: Was important to us.
- hitns://www.declanboom	com/architectite/ Slogan Altreat 📚	- 22 We made this up "Artist's	/architect's tate"
em2nstonisareat-zurich-A9	23-2014	Artista	
Éxcernt of "Toni-Areal Die	Gunst der Stunde» intto://www.attreat.ch/nc/home		
" ein kultureller Eneraiekn	otth"	- ²³ Excerpt of "May L help Ye	ou?", by Andrea 🐂
the section of the second seco	/thoman /houten / 15 Event of an Interview mit E	M2N. Archito Fragor 1001, " for away fr	ions the passions

_vis-kom

The communication with the users is a crucial part of the method and ongoing critism. How to communicate with unprofessionals is documented on the next pages.



















In architecture and urban design, methodology is abasic building block of design practice. It helpsuncover problems, answer questions, and develop possible solutions. Methods generate ideas and bring about decisions. The findings and results from these processes remain transparent.

This guide permits two levels of reading. On the one hand, a selective reading of a specific method as an institutional critique, and on the other, an examination of the method itselve; the state of an ongoing process with the ambition to turn critical analysis into productive space.



Eidgenössische Technische Hochschule Y Swiss Federal Institute of Critique Y

ISBN: 000-0-0000-0000-0